



TIMELY METHODS FOR NOVEL TIMES!



Open Space facilitated by /Improbable
Friday 11 February 2022

Organised by
 Michelle Bastian, University of Edinburgh
 Christina Berg Johansen, Wildtime
 Hedda Susanne Molland, University of Bergen
 Elisabeth Schøyen Jensen, University of Bergen
 Miriam Jensen, Aalborg University, WSP Denmark and Skanderborg Water Utility

Finished Reports

Improbable

Introduction

On the morning of Friday 11 February 2022, we brought together a group of 106 people online to ask the question: We need different times, but do we have the methods to unfold them?

Human life and organization need to be fundamentally transformed to support more inclusive and sustainable worlds. This requires attention to a key foundation of shared life and agency: time and temporality. While rational, instrumental, and typically short-term agency is a taken-for-granted structure in late modern society, this has impeded an understanding of the complexity of ecosystems, of social change and of the inter-relations between individuals, people and their worlds. Changing temporal habits and orientations requires experimentation, reflection, collaboration, and methods for researching the complexity of time with and across collectives.

Research on time and temporality abounds across a range of disciplines and sites. Alongside this thematic interest, is an interest in how we go about this research, with adaptations of traditional methods such as time use studies, mapping exercises and new approaches such as artistic research.

The particular focus for this event was to bring together those interested in working with time in groups and communities, and explore processes and methods to collectively understand the pressures and possibilities of time.

This event was facilitated by Improbable using Open Space Technology – a format which means the agenda is created by the people in the room on the day, ensuring that attendees get to talk about the issues that are most useful and burning for them. It is a democratic and non-hierarchical space open to anyone.

Continue reading for the reports that came out of this event. These reports came from each of the sessions called at the event, and include the notes of the discussion. They may be fairly informal.

Table of Contents

Participatory research for understanding time(s) as experienced	4
Thinking about the (problematic?) temporalities of public policy	6
Sustainable and nurturing methods in time	8
Creative methods for making legible more-than-human temporalities	9
Rethinking the tools of the planner: The planner as a deliberator across and with different times	13
Scaling down and speeding up? The temporalities and implications of the global climate mitigation imaginary	14
Phenology out of joint: Precarious practices exploring temporal frameworks through culture, phenology and seasonality	17
Language and temporality	18
Representing future people in the present	20
Lived extraordinary bodily times	22
Rituals as a temporal device in organizations	25
Crystal and water, rock and flesh: stages of fluidity and notions of time	28
Temporalities of place-embedded long term environmental protest	31
Ways of talking about time as an organisational infrastructure, rather than eternity, linear time, past/present/future, pace etc - time as way of organising communities	32
Deculturing time	34
Temporal ontologies; non-human haunting	35
Time and politics -- [in particular: are political times a problem for climate/Anthropocene?]	36
Methods to research time as justice and as power relation in everyday life	37

Participatory research for understanding time(s) as experienced

Who called the session: Sui-Ting Kong and Sarah Banks, s.j.banks@durham.ac.uk

Who participated in the session:

Rasmus Johnsen: wondering if the distinction human/non-human doesn't just reiterate what it is that it tries to avoid? The non-human in these terms is simply a boundary term for the human, not an 'outside'. At the same time, 'the human', whatever that is, does not represent what we are. To ourselves, we are - our bodies, our minds, our experience, our senses, our being a habitat for a multitude of viruses - largely non-human.

Nana- Francisca: participatory performance as research, exploring landscapes and inviting people to enter and co-created with the landscape (shared and unshared), human-nonhuman time(s)

Elisabeth Schoyen Jensen: participant observation, finding creative ways to explore seasons. Challenges: institutions do not agree with the ways that seasons/times are experienced by people in their everyday life. Personalised Norwegian calendar vs how it has been constructed

Beckie Coleman: different kinds of partners to think about digital future in a non-tech-centric way. Emergence vs pushing an agenda, how to navigate in a collaborative and participatory way.

Nadia and Epok: Time Zone research lab - how times work in groups. how can we be more intimate with time? is time incarcerated and if yes how can we liberate it? Working with people from all over the world who might sleep in the long sessions. Absence and presence and dropping in and out of the labs created an on-and-off welcome/introduction. (timezoneresearchlab@gmail.com)

Catherine Phillips: embodied, emplaced temporalities, experiences / contestations / imaginaries of more-than-human worldings and temporalities (particular nonhumans of interest -- pollinators (bees) and plants).

Nicole Gombay: Interested in Elisabeth's comments on people not knowing whether they have something to say. People whose capacities are limited; People aren't aware that time affects how they experience things - how can we make them feel comfortable to express themselves?

Nadia's response to Nicole: We would take 2 hours of the day called 'mending the web' (@nadia, is that right? @sui ting yes!). It is a space for people to revisit the past

activities with no agenda. It is actually where the meaning making is happening - it is the informality that allows this to happen. They are people who left school or those who are neurodivergent, and the space allows people to weave the divergence through conversations. (how to do that, asked Nicole) Nadia records everything and write back to the group what had happened, including a weekly podcast. The stories happened in the space will be made into signposts, and eventually axiomatic recursivities that threaded through the research and told back to the group through other story telling activities. For example, each season ended with a puppet party, where puppets are made of the themes, authors, equations etc and speak directly to each other.

Nana-Francisca: Nadia's experience reminded her about large-scale participatory performance. The group took on its life and became its own existence. How these self-sustaining stories include also the landscape and non-human?

Erica Baffelli: religious minorities in Japan, concept of fear in the Buddhist communities in Japan and the UK. Working across cultures and languages might work better with the use of arts rather than use of written languages.

How we establish shared time and what that does to our ways of relating...

Sui Ting - Looking into the everyday to find the best method.
Institutionalisation of time - doesn't fit life. Push back? Timeliness for people experiencing domestic violence.

Thinking about the (problematic?) temporalities of public policy

Who called the session: Graeme Tiffany

Who participated in the session:

- The danger of splitting the psychological and the social
- Ask: what has been excluded?
- Ask: why do some public policy narratives (like Trauma informed practice) prove so attractive?
- Consider the power of a scientific claim: does neuroscience validate trauma theories?
- If we allow dimensions to separate / split do we end up with each claiming they have been 'cancelled'?
- Consider then the temporalities of 'cancel culture'; are we falling into cancel culture?
- Might then we argue that the therapist and the community educator have more in common than not?
- Observe the privatisation of knowledge; knowledge entrepreneurs, who may seduce us to thinking that a little knowledge is enough - might this be 'weirdly democratising' and at the same time anti-democratic?
- Intensification of the lives of practitioners might mean they prefer something reductive.
- See also Growth Mindset; Mindfulness etc. how did these ideas / narratives / policies get such purchase?
- Then the issue of resource constraint / resources in general; if we all need resources for our work is it implied that we have to follow the policy trends (and the resources they make available)?

Chronicling the flux; Intuitive Judgements of Age

Who called the session: Paul Tuppeny

Who participated in the session: Paul Tuppeny

Through my sculpture practice, I have been looking into how we use 'age' phenomena to chronicle the changes inherent in the entities that surround us and make up our environment.

This feels like an important facet of our perception of the world as it provides us with genuine object-persistence and allows us to anticipate change and to fully develop our understanding of the objects around us through a deeper knowledge of their nature as they relate to our own needs. I had hoped to have a discussion as to how such intuitive judgements of 'age' influence our social behaviour.

www.paultuppeny.co.uk

Sustainable and nurturing methods in time

Who called the session: Clare Holdsworth

Who participated in the session: Clare Holdsworth, Michelle Bastian, Rebecca Birch

This question comes from a life course perspective.

- After 30 years of researching Clare is reflecting on the 'space junk' of research, mental, physical and material. There's so much stuff! - what do we do with all the participatory arts stuff
- Trend toward creative research leaving so much longer term detritus - postcards, banners.
- Geographical accumulation of weight, the time needed to do interviews
- Is there a point across academic careers where we stop doing anything new, and instead focus on the secondary use of data. How do we think about reduce/reuse/recycle in terms of research?
- Moving across careers, there is a question about timely methods over the life course of a researcher, moving from wanting to create lots of new material, then finding you have so much, so many interviews, surveys, ethnographic notes, and wanting to do right by all the people who donated their time to you.

Creative methods for making legible more-than-human temporalities

Who called the session: Rupert Griffiths

Who participated in the session: Els Roding, Annelieke Driessen, Julien3, Rojda, Charlotte Bates, Amy Cutler, Ching-In Chen, Astrid2, Rebecca Birch, Helen Cornish, Kat12, Hannah Reeves, Michele Barker, Tessa Gordziejko, Diane Borden, Kelly Streekstra, Mandy, Sara Axtell, Anna, Laura Denning, Sofia Rivera, Anna-Katharina, Maria Roca, Dawn Lyons, Anna Raupach, Rasmus Johnsen, Markus Lundstöm, Catherine Phillips, Captioner - Tracy, Nana Francisca Schottländer, Christina Berg Johansen

We had an amazing discussion - there is a lot of very interesting and exciting work going on among the group.

Questions and themes that arose include:

What precisely do we mean by creative methods? Are such methods primarily concerned with the relationship between science, technology, and art/design? Are they concerned with communication?

How can we empathise with the more-than-human (living or non-living)?
How can we access more-than-human temporalities, given that we are constrained by our human selves and societies?

How can we understand and even experience the temporalities of resources, such as the extraction, movement, and flow involved in the material-human assemblages of organisations such as steel manufacturers? How can managers connect and empathise not only with their staff but also with materials and their temporalities? What does an object ask of us?

Do we need to empathise? What other strategies might there be for accessing more-than-human temporalities?

Scientific methods - remove the body and questions of empathy from understanding of more-than-human temporalities. Challenge approaching time as (human) experience. Ask 'how is time?' rather than 'how is time experienced?'.

The role of place when thinking about temporalities. For example, embodied archaeology; place-based theatre; palimpsest of times and places; layers of co-existing stories.

How can we explore the relationship between bodies, prosody, and metre (e.g., through theatre and writing)? Writing through the unit of breath. What would more-than-human prosody/metre look like?

Members of the group were using various methods, approaches, and theoretical perspectives for accessing and/or describing more-than-human temporalities: Circadian clocks - for example, how do we track the circadian clocks in microbes? Must rely on scientific approaches to approach such temporalities.

Haunting

The uncanny

Technology - e.g., use of immersive media, virtual reality, augmented reality, etc. to disrupt temporalities - for example, re-imagining oneself in past, future, alternative present through such technologies.

Soundscapes, merging of voices, interference of voices.

Film and animation

Temporalities of war and effects of war on more-than-human temporalities

Narrative: from a multiplicity of voices, including the more-than-human

Performance and choreography - synchronising the body with or exposing the body to more-than-human rhythms - tides, pendulum and gyroscopic movements of objects. Does this create a connection between selves and more-than-human temporalities or does it reveal a dissonance and/or inability to coordinate with such temporalities?

Some problems were also identified:

Privilege - much of this work requires presence of participant/audience; may be unequal access.

Technology - advances, becomes obsolete; unequal access to technology; and unequal access to skills.

Access - does everything need to be accessible to everyone? Is it not also important to give access to small specific or targeted groups?

Possible to read, experience art, etc. that help us become attentive to more-than-human temporalities, but how can this actually be brought into everyday life? Doesn't this require dedication and continuous effort?

If we find it difficult to put ourselves in the position of other humans, even our partner for example, what hope do we have regarding more-than-human?

There is a risk of thinking inadequately about other human experiences and the extremes of temporal inequality - It is important not to forget the multiplicity of human voices and the inequalities that effect their legibility and force. Also a risk of overlooking the variety of experiences of time according to cultures and spaces.

Suggestions for future explorations:

from Els Roding/Annelieke Driesen:

There is an excellent (anthropological) ethnography called 'Earth Beings' by Marisol de la Cadena, on ways of knowing and being; it explores mountains as beings with their own temporalities, and opens up a space in which incommensurability is a given in interactions between people, and people and things dukeupress.edu/earth-beings

from Kely Streekstra:

I think you might be interested in the work of Next Nature Network, they at present are building the museum of technology of the future and our novel understandings of what 'nature' culturally entails, and they have built a VR timetravel experience at display now. The museum is here: <https://www.nextnature.net/projects/new-evoluon> and the VR time travel here: <https://nextnaturefuturetravels.com/en>

from Mandy Rose <http://i-docs.org/> @collabdocs

COW by Andrea Arnold, My Octopus Friend, Gunda feature docs that try to decentre the human.

Immersive Documentaries that explore / disrupt temporality

inc <http://lisajackson.ca/Biidaaban-First-Light-VR>

First Light one of a number of works by Indigenous artists that have engaged Virtual Reality - "Fourth VR: Indigenous virtual reality

practice" <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/1354856520943083>

Marshmallow Laser Feast have created a number of projects re the more-than-human inc Treehugger, Inthe Eyesof the

Animal <https://www.marshmallowlaserfeast.com/>

from Tessa Gordziejko:

The temporal dimension of extraction of minerals and fossil fuels - we are burning time, fuel laid down over millennia, burning the past and the future. There's a good book called Fossil Capital by Liam Gerrard

from Sofia Rivera:

Maria Puig de la Bellacasa's response to the concern of anthropocentrism: "Because for more caring affective ecologies to become possible, we need speculative thinking, and fair amount of fabulation, so that the anxieties that the attribution of human modes of intentionality to non humans generate in critical thinkers do not paralyze our ethical imagination" m.p.b Matters of Care Speculative ethics in more than human worlds, p.219

Amy Cutler: I might not speak because I have Covid and my voice is feeble but: I wonder if part of this discussion is also not just how non-human temporality works, but also how non-human temporality breaks down? There are discussions of the 'extinct uncanny' and how extinction unravels our sense of temporality, linear story, narrative, etc. But it doesn't just unravel human temporality, or human species time.

Rethinking the tools of the planner: The planner as a deliberator across and with different times

Who called the session: Miriam Jensen

Who participated in the session: Christina (Wildtime), Miriam Jensen, Mille (Emilie) Jensen, Asya Karaseva, Marcus Tang Merit, Leonoor Borgesius, Andy Inch, Alena Thiel, Michelle Bastian

Participants were interested in planning and methods in terms of mapping and what temporalities maps represent, organisational temporalities, architectural temporalities, temporalities of planning and temporalities of management and communication (such an interesting group).

We are lacking methods for the planner to dive into other forms of temporalities. What methods do people have experience with within this session? Many future-oriented methods - what futures do we ask into? How do we make sure the futures represented are inclusive to the people who participate?

Andy talked about reframing as a practice with temporalities, not conflict resolution per se - and the re-entering on the present.

Time as abstract notion - how to "get at" the other temporalities at play - and how to do it in practice with communities and groups? There is a methodological issue here - we need new methods to get at other times with people.

architectural time - future models as an exclusion device also - Michelle talked "MUF" architects who uses more inclusive methods and talk to people before pres.

Marcus mentioned how it is important when we do workshops, participatory methods and so on - that we are aware of the power it comes with - that the temporal structures embedded in these workshops are important to pay attention to and also the temporalities that are represented within them.

Michelle mentioned how it is also important afterwards - how we represent and event/workshops/participatory thing afterwards- and the power that lies herein.

Michelle talked about when does abstract notions of time translates into something that makes sense for people? Sometimes people have moments.

Scaling down and speeding up? The temporalities and implications of the global climate mitigation imaginary

Who called the session: Isak Stoddard

Who participated in the session: Laura op de Beke, Hedda Susanne Molland, Duncan McLaren, Mathias Venning, Eric Lilius, Sarah Robertson, Isak Stoddard, Markus Lundström, Laila Omar, Leonoor Borgesius

Notes by Laura (with some edits and additions by Isak):

What might the global climate mitigation imaginary/imaginaries be? What is global about it?

- The current dominant imaginary is the idea that we can achieve net-zero (balance of residual emissions and removals), achieved through nationally determined reductions on emissions, so as to stabilise climate (possibly within 1.5C goal) (technocratic, modelled, 'race to zero')
- Due to absence of sufficient mitigation to reach goals in e.g. Paris Agreement, a number of technological fixes are being considered and included in e.g. IPCCs mitigation scenarios via Integrated assessment modelling (IAMs) (with varying degrees severity when it comes to potential side-effects and consequences)
- Negative emissions technology (carbon capture and storage is predominantly legislated at a national scale, BECCS dominates the IPCCs IAMs), (increasingly packaged as so called "Nature-based solutions).
- net zero as balance? Does balance have to mean a state of rest or is there room for reframing this imaginary in terms of movement and ongoing change?
- rainforest conservation (and stopping deforestation)
- Sulphate aerosol injections (also known as solar geoengineering, SRM). Luckily still a moratorium on this (<https://www.cbd.int/climate/geoengineering/>) and increasing calls from scholars e.g for non-use agreements: see e.g. <https://www.solargeoeng.org/>
- renewable energy technologies (so far just added on top of fossil fuel use, not replacing fossil fuel demand or decreasing energy use on an aggregate level.

Complications and other issues

- when the Norwegian gov refers to global they refer to the global energy market. Development and the level of energy consumption are considered constants. But the global could also leave the door open for global biodiversity, global environmental consciousness of whatever.

- Deadlinism = the compression of future time e.g. "twelve more years! 10 more years! Only five more years to fix climate change!!!" Do these approaches leave no time for changing relations (or even 'hospicing modernity')?
- Plotting mitigation in the future obscures the urgency for action in the present? And does it draw a veil over differentiated historical responsibilities? [climate policy framings have evolved over time - so a 'developing imaginary'? see <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41558-020-0740-1>]
- issue of not being vigilant of our abstractions (Whitehead). E.g. the modern concept of Energy (underpinned by the science of thermodynamics) and its birth in the early 1800s. Is it a coincidence that it emerged in a similar time and place as industrialisation, see e.g: <https://www.dukeupress.edu/the-birth-of-energy> (and this recorded lecture by Larry Lohmann: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sUuEADRKcSY>).

Are there other imaginaries?

- global outpouring of science fiction about climate change and cc adaptation and mitigation. Some dystopian, some optimistic (e.g. solarpunk) The Ministry for the Future by Kim Stanley Robinson
- important to consider decolonial and indigenous imaginaries too - see work by Kyle Whyte for example; and Mike Hulme's 'Weathered'. Hospicing Modernity by Vanessa Machado de Oliveira

What is the role of global institutions?

What does the "global" contain when referring to global climate mitigation?

What are the implicit temporalities in this imaginary

- deadlineism (creates a chronological focus)
- postponement
- expectations of technological innovation and development
- urgency framing
- scarcity of time and "volume" left in the global carbon budget

Resources:

- for a good book on mitigation technologies and their imagined applications see Holly Jean Buck's After Geoengineering <3
- work by Kyle Whyte for example; and Mike Hulme's 'Weathered' by Charlie Lloyd
- Isabelle Stengers: Another Science is possible: A manifesto for slow science: <https://www.wiley.com/en-us/Another+Science+is+Possible%3A+A+Manifesto+for+Slow+Science+-p-9781509521814>

How my day's going in various climate response futures

Political compasses are never very good but at least they can be silly

ECOMODERNISM

We're taking the kin-kids on a hovertrain trip out to the space elevator pad past the Carbon Towers to welcome our grans back from their working holiday at the Lunar Chinampa Project.

Taking the hoverferry out to work on Offshore Low-Atmosphere Spray Raft 71, where I'm close to a promotion to Repair Robot Repair Technician III if I keep my credit score up.

solarpunk futures

My team's working on a hydroponic inlet fitting with bio-inspired nanopillars to keep algae from gunking it up, and this evening I'll be a co-chair at the Neighborhood Restoration Meeting.

grim cyberpunk futures

Getting helicoptered out with the rest of the guest workers to clean the waste items off the razor wire on the Defensive Seawall before the GDP Growth Announcement Parade.

ECOSOCIALISM

We're working on our application to spend two years as assistant sled-wrights with a caribou commune in the Pleistocene Tundra Reserve.

TODAY

I bought as much meat, vegetables, and drinks as I could carry for \$100. In line at the grocery I looked at my smartphone and the headlines were about people dying at the borders in the Mojave and the Mediterranean.

ECOFASCISM

Doing inventory in the Second Perimeter Armory to make sure we have enough ammo to last us until the next harvest/raid season.

goat farm futures

One of our goats is acting especially strange, so we're walking her over the ridge to a village that specializes in veterinary medicine, plus bringing them some of our beans.

prepper futures

Well, it's bean harvest season, so I guess I'm picking beans unless there's another raid drill.

DEGROWTH

Phenology out of joint: Precarious practices exploring temporal frameworks through culture, phenology and seasonality

Who called the session: Fred Hubble

Who participated in the session: Scott Bremer; Kristin Hussey; Kate Foster; Marja van Schie; Hannah Reeves; Paul Tuppeny

Cultural definitions of seasonality - what is a season? How is it specific to a place?

Where does temporality and seasonality meet?

How can we work with the idea of seasonality?

How does modern life eliminate or clash with seasonality?

Religious festivals and relationship to seasons

Specific places: UK, Australia, high Arctic

Are seasons time? Are they an element of time?

Seasons as lived time

Example - farmers experience, most busy in the summer.

Certain groups still more closely aligned with the seasons.

Do we all need to be more aware of the seasons?

adapting to seasonal practices - ex, chefs who forage and make use of seasonal produce. What is a

Language and temporality

Who called the session: Hazel Streeter hazel.streeter@bristol.ac.uk

Who participated in the session: Victoria, Maria, Helen, plus others whose names I didn't catch - please add them here if you like. Also please add surnames and contact details if you wish these to be circulated with attendees.

-Partial and Tentative Notes by Hazel-

We began the conversation by sharing what captivated our interest in discussing language and temporality. One participant, Victoria, shared that they had been working on the language of waiting. Another, Maria, shared that they are researching a pidgin language historically spoken by indigenous people in a part of Russia, which was viewed as 'backwards' by the Soviets.

This led to questions about how hierarchical perceptions of languages might be linked to temporal hierarchy. In a progress-focussed society, that which is associated with the past may not be considered valuable. We mentioned that folklore is a term connected with temporality, linking present to past through tradition. We wondered what direction we might be facing when considering 'tradition' - is it always nostalgic? What are the implications of that?

Is there a connection between remoteness of place and a kind of temporal parochialism? Or a different inflection to temporal perception? Does local language influence how we inhabit time or reflect different temporal habitation? One participant mentioned Welsh and Wenglish (Welsh/English), which in their experience had distinctive temporal expressions, for example 'in a minute now'. Later we mentioned the idea of temporal wilderness, or the (often colonial) idea that some places are outside of time.

Another participant, Helen, shared that her work is on how contemporary witches interact with their history, including how they inherit the past. We discussed how the sometimes separate categories of history and folklore might talk about and interact with each other.

We discussed how language acquires meaning because of its history. We briefly considered the temporality of mythology, which is often conceived of as time outside of historical time.

Another participant asked, why do we talk about 'time without us'? Why do we have the idea of times multiple but we talk about time singular (I don't have time, that was in time, doing time)? Why is it that we often talk about time as if it were the enemy?

We talked a little about potential connections between language and embodied perceptions of time - how language might influence how we perceive the effect of time on our bodies and reflect our temporal experience of the world through sensory patterns. How sound, and particularly the sound of language, can be linked to pulses and rhythms. Can this be explored as a way of orienting ourselves to more-than-human temporalities, through a process of 'hearing into', or resonance?

Representing future people in the present

Who called the session: Duncan McLaren

Who participated in the session: Mathias Venning, Sarah Banks, Kate Foster, Tessa Gordziejko, David Farrier, Maria Roca, Julien Thomas, others not captured

Issues arising:

How do we imagine the interests of future people when working on issues like climate change?

Can we use analogies with history? How people today talk about colonialism and slavery?

Do young people offer a better proxy for future interests?

Young people (rightly) point out that they should be respected as represent now (not relegated to future interests), and that while they are currently being 'valued' as climate activists, they are being instrumentalised (and not valued in other ways). Also, young people are being loudest in pointing out how current people, especially in global South, are already suffering.

What ethical or epistemic challenges are there? Can our current language & conceptual understandings represent the future? Can it constrain our representations of the future?

Algorithmic cultures are constructing futures of young people (in disempowering ways). As are quantitative and modelling methods (e.g. IAMs). Can we find / design creative methods, stories, narratives, scenarios, deliberation etc that help us encounter the future on its own terms?

How can we place future people in future contexts/environments/cultures? How important are people? does 'nature' have rights? How can we conceptualise this in terms of ecological systems?

Culturally, I'm interested in how we honour ancestors as well as future ancestors - how do we engage with temporal connectivity in understanding our responsibilities

Future Generations reading group:

Roman Krznaric, The Good Ancestor

Sarah M. Broom, The Yellow House

Natalie Diaz, Postcolonial Love Poem

Juietta Singh, The Breaks

James Bradley, Clade (this is for the next meeting: <https://lighthousebookshop.com/events/the-future-generations-book-group-clade-online>)

Ministry of the Future - Kim Stanley Robinson

Risk that urgency of climate concerns will lead to authoritarian responses. Argument instead for more democracy <https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/climate-emergency-democracy-fork/> Democracy as both requiring, and being a tool to work with, uncertainty about futures.

I wonder what the counter arguments are, philosophically, to the argument that people in the future have no (fixed) identity (Parfit) so aren't people that can be taken into account? Possible responses: 'temporal bias' and care ethics or virtue ethics.

How can we ensure that when we take future interests into account, this also respects the spatial extent of existing climate harm (global south, other species, indigenous peoples already experiencing climate catastrophe)?

Lots to learn from history. Especially perhaps from a better understanding of the history of protest and resistance.

Care (and empathy): how do we extend these across time, geography and species boundaries?

Political scientist Scott Hamilton argues that "The Anthropocene" posits a "end of governmentality" - making the world less governable - because it removes any sense of agency or influence over humanity or human groups. Scott Hamilton, 2018, "Foucault's End of History: The Temporality of Governmentality and its End in the Anthropocene", Millennium: Journal of International Studies, vol. 46.3

Love in a time of terror, Barry Lopez on self-love entwined with love of landscapes - <https://lithub.com/barry-lopez-love-in-a-time-of-terror/?fbclid=IwAR2kk2iO5Lac7shCFRn1BSt219wNNATVh3KH1QmHvkyE121CfT3SBsRS0R4>

Lived extraordinary bodily times

Who called the session: Nicole Gombay

Who participated in the session: Kristin Hussey; Matthew Howard; Asya Karasyova

Matt: When we talk about 'extraordinary' time this requires us to consider what we see as "ordinary" --> we start to see what's sustaining 'normal' time

Victoria: -- researches lived experience of furlough -- people who aren't working and are waiting it out -- ontological status of the waiting body [Nicole's question: how do we research this?]

An aside: -- diagnosis of breast cancer & having temporal markers injected into the body & the extraordinary experience of this

Kristin: interested in mundane body time and what happens when bodies intersect with things that are endogenous to them.

Rasmus: researches boredom " experience is extraordinary -- "time as a naked entity" -- wants to hear about distortions of temporal experience. Has worked with people with schizophrenia, Alheimers, depression. For Alzheimers, time as meteorological -- weirdly changing. In depression, time's something that's past, like a ménage-à-2, like drops of water; time has left people behind. In schizophrenia, time's like a movie where people have actively to reconstruct time [Q: how research these??]

Paul: How much of our temporal experience is related to our needs? For people on ships, where needs are met/set in place by being contained -- they're in a social bubble & their relations with other are also slowed down. The return to land changes this.

Rasmus: has done research in prisons, "time is an enemy" --> what do people do while they're "doing time"? There's a dimension of monstrous time. As people near their release from prison this weighs particularly heavily on them.

Kristin: as a historian, wants to research time experience in the Arctic. Boredom, repetition, what role the environment plays in this as people are in darkness. How will she do this research? Extracting from published records, perhaps. But there's the challenge of inference from the written material -- will be a sort of discourse analysis.

Victoria: uses interviews. The people she spoke to use metaphor as a way to articulate things that might otherwise be hard to articulate. In the interviews she asks people about their temporal experiences via different questions throughout the

interview, e.g., how they structure time; what are the atmospheres of time. Waiting as a form of disorientation. [Question from Matt re: boredom on furlough] You'd think that people on furlough are either a) bored or b) having fun, but mostly they feel a loss of sense of self. People try to replicate the rhythms of work; or they binge watch as temporal markers; people can feel disorientated, i.e., "are eased into it [what?!] and don't like it"

Matt: Q: How does guilt work?

Victoria: Guilt's most often expressed by people who are "in relation to a productive other" -- felt guilt. One man binge watched a tv show, it was a guilty pleasure, but then he said he'd got rid of the guilt " I don't care"

Matt: Interesting how guilt can come to express itself, e.g., people with chronic/long-term illness

Victoria: Guilt felt by people on furlough because they're out of synch with work.

Paul: Is guilt culturally conditioned?

Victoria: Some people on furlough immediately replicated the rhythm/pattern of work, stuck to work temporalities, particularly people whose work is about time. They were more aware of it & stuck to work time. V. also wrote a paper about queuing during the 1st lockdown in Britain [?]; it was how people lived that time. Paul: At that time, people felt as though they had time. Victoria: only during the 1st lockdown was there this extraordinary temporality.

Paul: Spoke of father's experience of WWII, people's doors were open. It was a period of openness & passiveness. When the war ended, their doors shut.

Paul: His research is on age, how people track time through the development of things around them; how we measure ourselves via things.

Kristin: Asked people in her research "where they feel time in themselves" -- people talked about... [didn't manage to note the rest, sorry!]

Paul: Spent time in the Arctic (Norway); people stick to time, e.g., go to bed at fixed time, but the birds keep going; they don't roost

Kristin: Seasonality; living beings are seasonal, though humans don't always recognize this

Victoria: amongst the people on furlough were some whose circadian rhythms went off. But when they returned to work it went back to normal.

Kristin: Working from home is something where there's a break between the body and the environment; it's a break from normal social structures [comment made in response to my Q. about what it means when the body defines time, not via external societal structures]

Paul: His research is on how we deal with awareness that everything is in flux, always changing; what are the models we develop, via things, to understand this awareness. We are "chronologizing animals" [?]. There's a move from anticipation to loss that's part of this process. He looks at how people use found materials and sculpture to communicate decay e.g., Rodin's Age of Bronze. Relies on phenomenological philosophers.

Book mentioned in chat: Kevin Birth: Objects of Time: how things shape temporality

Rituals as a temporal device in organizations

Who called the session: Christina Berg Johansen (reach out: christina@wildtime.dk)

Who participated in the session: Fred Hubble, Katrine Buus, Christina Berg Johansen, Clare Holdsworth, Eric Lilius and others

HEY THERE :). I got to my own called session late! (20 minutes in)

How do we lower the threshold for meeting and collaborating with more-than-human lives in their manifold temporalities?

What rituals do you have experience with, that help you meet those others?

How do you invite other people into the meetings?

NOTES

We talked about the sibling of rituals: routines. The repetition that gives us a sense of security. Katrine (I think) described some of her work in hospices and how the 'emotionality of time' is structured in small repetitive actions that have a ritual quality to them. And when routines and small rituals are removed, as happened e.g. with Covid-19, everyday settings are ruptured and uncertainty takes over.

The power of these small rituals... An example was shared about helping a group of youth write diaries and in that way structure and give care and attention to their everyday lives.

Then there are the more collective rituals - or even just the multiplicity of many small rituals/routines - that connect us with greater narratives. The rush hour, for example, or Friday beers. It doesn't have to be named as or entered into as a ritual to be one. (Clare)

Rituals can also be political, a form of communication about one's community to others or internally. Eric shared the story of living for some time in the Findhorn community in Scotland, where shared activity was typically precluded by meeting in a circle, silently, connecting with each other - and how much that small and simple way of giving attention to the present and the people around one, would make collaboration afterwards easier (more about Findhorn, see here: <https://www.findhorn.org/>)

A bit of talk about theory - Fred shared this:

'We can define rituals as symbolic techniques of making oneself at home in the world. They transform being-in the world into a being-at-home. They turn the world into a reliable place. They are to time what a home is to space: they render time habitable. They even make it accessible, like a house. They structure time, furnish it.'

Chul-Han, Byung, and Daniel Steuer. 2020. The Disappearance Of Rituals: A Topology Of The Present. Cambridge: Polity. p.2
(followed by some discussion about the epistemological value of some of their work).

We had a talk about the collection of weather, of how to be in weather and make it sensuous to others. The rituals of collecting things - what happens when you do that with phenomena/life that is not immediately material? Some examples of collecting storms and rain:



Danish-Greenlandic artist Nina Maria Kleivan works with collecting rain from different experiences and places. <https://ninakleivan.dk/site2/>



And then time was up. :)

Crystal and water, rock and flesh: stages of fluidity and notions of time

Who called the session: Nana Francisca Schottländer

Who participated in the session: Rebecca Birch and Nana Francisca Schottländer

Talking about artistic practices of exploring themes of how rocks and humans interact, how rocks journey through time and across landscapes and parts of the world - because of natural processes and because of human extraction and use. How we can meet across flesh and mineral and establish other, intimate relations.

How to explore these and other relationships between humans and other than humans, which formats to employ - video, tekst, performance, installation - to share experiences and exchanges in meaningful ways.

Where is the work? What is the editing process?

"Can Calendar Customs Engender Stewardship of Our Natural Environment?"

And when should we be worried about nostalgia?

Who called the session: Elisabeth Schøyen Jensen, inspired by article by Parkes-Nield
Who participated in the session: Sara Axtell, Helen Cornish, Hedda Moland, Elisabeth Jensen, Hannah Reeves

Brief summary of the article:

It looks at case studies of communities in England that are reviving local customs that are connected to seasonality. The article also looks at how calendar customs are used in fiction. It argues these practices can help us get attuned to our surrounding. The local is a gateway to the global.

Comments:

- how does this read to people who live in urban centres and for whom these rituals seem very far away?
- Uncomfortableness with the uncritical celebration of old folksy methods
- neo-pagan traditions
- some romanticism but also a lot of future orientation.
- How do we use nostalgia as a way to orient us to the future (e.g. petromelancholia by Stephanie LeMenager)

Sara Axtell's work (healingrootscommunity.com)

- unsettling in Minnesota. Part of dismantling whiteness is reconnection to culture. Oversimplification remains a risk. How do we coach ourselves to keep naming all the complexities? Preserving and reconnecting to traditional communities.

Laura: how do we adapt customs to a changing world and climate?

- Can we use traditional customs to increase our awareness of these changes?
- e.g. the "11 steden tocht" an ice-skating competition in the NL where it hasn't frozen hard enough for 20 years to hold the competition. There's a guy who swam the course to call attention to climate change

How is seasonality reflected in our on-line platforms?

Seasonality in terms of weather vs. calendrical seasons / seasons in entertainment media (season 1-2 of a show, seasonal releases of game assets).

Seasonality in gaming, how the more seasonal games like Stardew valley slower..

Neo-pagan practices in a community in London, centred on a grave yard and a community garden. Connecting, reconnecting and disconnecting different communities and histories.

Bruno Seraphin, 2016. "The Hoop" and Settler Apocalypse, *The Trumpeter* vol 32, no. 2 about seasonality and movement and who has already experienced apocalypse - the article's assumptions are not necessarily unproblematic.

Wonderful conversation! thanks so much!

Temporalities of place-embedded long term environmental protest

Who called the session:

Who participated in the session:

Note for Rebecca: Over the past week Dutch activists have protested the logging of the "Sterrebos" by camping out in the trees. The last campaigners have now been removed by the police and the forest will be cut to facilitate the expansion of an automobile factory ... But now the campaigners claim to have spotted two nesting forest owls (threatened species) in the little patch of woods. If their presence is confirmed the logging will have to be called off because the owl is a protected species. What I find interesting is that the activists could only have spotted the owls because they spent several nights up in the canopy!

Ways of talking about time as an organisational infrastructure, rather than eternity, linear time, past/present/future, pace etc - time as way of organising communities

Who called the session: Michelle Bastian

Who participated in the session:

The discussion for this session started before I (MB) arrived, so hopefully someone else here will be able to add what was covered, but I came into discussions of conflicts of time being identified in organisations, and whether or not there is flexibility to deal with this. One example was a botanic garden, where office working hours of 9-5 are assumed, even though this means that during the winter gardeners need to show up when there is little for them to do, while in the summer they are working overtime to get everything done and not being compensated for it. Changing these times are non-negotiable though for managers. A second example was mothers at risk of having their children removed from social services and having to deal with very inflexible temporal structures. As well as the stark contrast between those in the detention hotel in Melbourne where tennis player Djokovic was placed during the Australian Open. Many have been there for many years, while there was international outcry when he was placed there for a few days <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-australia-59901094>

One comment was that in many ways we're asking again about the classic sociological question of agency versus structure. For example, we talked about tactics people use to change their sense of time. Michael Flaherty's timework is one reference here (Flaherty, M. G. (2011). *The Textures of Time: Agency and Temporal Experience*. Philadelphia, PA.: Temple University Press). Tactics that people used during covid - for example. But how to move from tactics to structural change? To protests, time policies, time activism, pushing for flexible understandings of temporalities, where requests for alternative times aren't dismissed as lazy (e.g. later starting times for teens during school due to changes in circadian rhythms), or nostalgic (different working times for outside labour for e.g.)? Getting it across as a reasonable and fair alternative, when dominant conceptions of time dismiss alternatives as not even worth considering. What movements are there to claim rights to different kinds of time?

Practical Examples of methods for raising these issues with groups for discussion.

- Juxtaposing difference systems.
- Important to find ways to avoid the clichéd and problematic comparison of indigenous peoples versus western cultures, which is often used as part of this tactic.

- e.g. medieval versus the present, e.g. canonical hours (a variable measure of 1/12 daytime that changes as day length longer/shorter in summer/winter) versus standardised hours
- Sunday opening hours in different European countries, cultures expecting all shops to be open 7 days a week versus experience where Sunday closing is the norm.
- gig economy and the temporalities required by people who do this job?
 - what does it do to your day, when you can order 5 times a day as a service user, what does it do to the people who provide this service for you as workers.
- e.g. one participant talking about experience of schools running in double shifts such as 7-1 and then 2.-8. Due to not enough buildings so school kids alternated their schedule. This was annoying, but also gave a sense of different ways to live in time.
- research mentioned on children having more sense of time autonomy when learning from home during the covid pandemic. How might this help us think differently about "time education"
- References to current activist movements based around time:
 - 4 day week movements.
 - workers doing long shifts - activism in healthcare setting framed around sleep - reclaiming circadian rhythms as the catch cry
 - I'm not sure what the particular reference was for this, but perhaps https://www.huffpost.com/entry/doctors-sleep_b_2050420
 - Barcelona Declaration on Time Use Policies
 - <https://www.timeuse.barcelona/barcelona-declaration-on-time-policies>
 - Rethinking Occupy Movement in temporal terms alongside it's spatial tactics? This article does this nicely Sharma, S. (2014). Because the Night Belongs to Lovers: Occupying the Time of Precarity. Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies, 11(1), 5-14. doi:10.1080/14791420.2013.828384

Deculturing time

Who called the session: Eric Lilius

Who participated in the session: Eric Lilius

As someone who is actively hospicing modernity, I find I am less bound by the time that is deeply embedded in the culture I was raised in, which was a British influenced Canada with all that the empire had to impose in its colonial manifestations.

Other cultures and parts of our culture operate on seasonal clocks for the planting and harvesting of plants and animals. Many of these cycles are being disrupted by the global disruption of traditionally understood and dependable weather patterns. Generally, we are not prepared in any organized way to deal with the changes coming.

These other ways of thinking about time have been disconnected and overridden by the culture of modernity.

Temporal ontologies; non-human haunting

Who called the session: Astrid Schrader

Who participated in the session: Amy Cutler, Rob, Hazel Streeter , Helen Cornish

Circadian rhythms in bacteria

metabolic performance

nature films

memories of extinct bird

memories inscribed in landscape ---> see Wild Dogs dreaming

hopeful haunting

summoning vs haunting

memory vs haunting

mourning

witches accessing the past in creative ways

technological methods - augmented landscapes, museums and live cinema, re-animating species/archives

Helen: time doesn't stay in place - a definition of time?

Rob: "when do you feel that haunting and when does it remain discursive"

Time and politics -- [in particular: are political times a problem for climate/Anthropocene?]

Who called the session: Blake Ewing

Who participated in the session: Hedda Susanne Molland, Alena3, Blake, Nil Uzun

Is political procedure part of the problem?

"regular proceedings" versus irregular or extraordinary - "taking time" for something? prioritization of time as an issue

Mike Hulme: Weathered and a blog where he discussed the problem of declaring a "climate emergency" for democratic processes <https://mikehulme.org/>

Dipesh Chakrabarty: On time in historiography and/or political or broader experiential times.

'Real time' as an ideal - very political - assuming that "realtime" is more important than for instance "past time"?

[Nil]Time and technology; time an acceleration -- narratives of acceleration, speed, deterministic computing speed, digital temporalities

The power of being dismissive of times.

Methods to research time as justice and as power relation in everyday life

Who called the session: Maro Pantazidou

Who participated in the session:

Some of the questions and ideas we touched on:

- We discussed how time is many times either researched as clock-time (e.g. quantitative time-use diaries researching the distribution of time) or as lived experience (e.g. interviews and other qualitative methods researching the values, affects, and other qualities that can associated with time), but that the issue of time as relational, as socially produced daily through (power) relations remains unexplored.
- We pondered what would it mean to do research that both embraces and simultaneously goes beyond issues of time distribution (e.g. who does more or less hours of care work) and time experience (how is time lived in different contexts), to study time as relational, as a collective resource. to do research that would focus on politics of interdependence.
- We shared some examples from our own work from the micro (how does gig work produce temporal inequalities? how does a rushed food delivery for one creates a slow lunch for someone else) to the macro (how do intensified farming practices in one country might be essential to maintaining 'slow food' movements in another - more powerful- country)
- We also discussed what examples of 'temporal activism' might serve to expose such issues of temporal justice? For example the fight of nurses in Israel for 'sleeping time'.
- We talked about many-many other things including if temporal justice can be possible within capitalism and if complexity theory can help us navigate the terrain of time as interdependence, but I don't have enough notes as the conversation was so captivating and generative.

Some of the Literature that got mentioned:

In the Meantime: Temporality and Cultural Politics by Sarah Sharma

Delayed Response: The Art of Waiting from the Ancient to the Instant World by Jason Farman

Complexity theory and social science: the state of the Art - Byrne and Callaghan

Panarchy Theory and Application - Allen et al. 2014